

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

JACQUELINE BENJAMIN, et al.,  
Plaintiffs,  
v.  
B & H EDUCATION, INC., et al.,  
Defendants.

Case No. 13-cv-04993-VC

**ORDER DENYING MOTIONS TO SEAL**

Re: Dkt. Nos. 74, 79, 83

The motions to seal are denied. "Those who seek to maintain the secrecy of documents attached to dispositive motions must meet the high threshold of showing that 'compelling reasons' support secrecy." *Kamakana v. City & Cty. of Honolulu*, 447 F.3d 1172, 1180 (9th Cir. 2006). Reliance on a prior protective order, without more, "is not a 'compelling reason' that rebuts the presumption of access." *Id.* at 1183.

**IT IS SO ORDERED.**

Dated: October 16, 2015



VINCE CHHABRIA  
United States District Judge